

The Role of the Interaction between NGOs and Foreign Policy in Turkey-Azerbaijan Relations

Dr. Nurbanu Bulgur

¹ Department of International Relations, Sakarya University
Corresponding Author: Nurbanu Bulgur

ABSTRACT: *The relationship between states and societies has changed under the influence of globalization in international relations, and public diplomacy has emerged as a kind of soft power besides traditional diplomacy in foreign policy. Non-governmental organizations, pressure groups, economies and media organizations have started to act as the main actors in these activities of the states towards other states and societies. Turkey was also affected by this development in the world. Especially after 1983 non-governmental organizations began to gain more importance through the active use of neo-liberalism in Turkey's foreign policy discourse and practice.*

Turkey in particular has put emphasis on public diplomacy in foreign policy in the 2000s and many public diplomacy organization was formed. Humanitarian aid, foreign economic relations, architectural and cultural activities, education and research work are the main works of Turkish public diplomacy. In addition to the official Turkish public diplomacy organizations that have been active in geographical areas, particularly in the Balkans, the Middle East, Central Asia and North Africa, non-governmental organizations and non-governmental organizations have also played an important role in the civilian stance of public diplomacy and in the practice of foreign policy.

The place of civil society organizations in Azerbaijan-Turkey relations are as old as the history of the civil society organizations in the two countries. However, it is observed that non-governmental organizations established in both countries in the late 19th and early 20th centuries contribute to bilateral relations. The occupation of Azerbaijan by Bolshevik Russia in 1920 limited the relations in general and completely prevented the development of the relations between the NGOs of the two countries. Therefore, the issue of the place of NGOs in bilateral relations mostly covers the period after the end of the Cold War and regaining the independence of Azerbaijan.

KEYWORDS: *NGOs, Turkey, Azerbaijan, Foreign Policy, Internationalization*

Date of Submission: 06-09-2023

Date of Acceptance: 18-09-2023

I. INTRODUCTION

International relations, in the traditional sense, is accepted as a field covering interstate relations in which the state is the main actor and carries out its political activities (Willetts, 2001:357). Definitions made on the concept of "actor", especially in international relations, also point to the state. To give a few examples: "According to James Dougherty, an international actor is "...an organized entity capable of developing more or less independent actions in the international arena" (Sönmezoğlu, 2005:20). "Hopkins-Mansbach duo also define the actor as "a relatively autonomous unit that exerts influence on the behavior of other autonomous actors" (Sönmezoğlu, 2005:20).

As can be seen from the definitions, an actor in the international arena; It is considered an autonomous entity that has the ability to develop independent actions and create a certain impact on other actors. Therefore, in the pre-Cold War period, since the entity with these qualifications was the state, it was considered the only actor in international relations. However, when the expression "nations" in the concept of "international relations" was taken only as states, international relations were understood as political relations between sovereign nation states, and therefore sovereign states were accepted as the main actors (Ari, 2010: 13).

Nowadays, the structure in which sovereign states are accepted as the main actors is changing rapidly and it is observed that the influence of non-state actors is increasing and they are in a constant development to increase this influence (Miall, 1999:35). For example, in the field of conflict resolution, apart from the state, the UN, regional organizations and non-governmental organizations are rapidly developing the role they play in this field. Therefore, today, the impact of non-state actors on international relations has risen to an indisputable position, and it is seen that international non-governmental organizations, in particular, have expanded their activities and spheres of influence in this field and have become actors (Yalçınkaya, 2006:505). Development of Civil Society-Foreign Policy Relationship After the Cold War

National non-governmental organizations also try to influence foreign policy in various ways and indirectly have a say in international relations. The change in international relations and foreign policy since the mid-20th century has increased the influence of civil society and added a new dimension to the civil society-foreign policy relationship. This change is based on several reasons. First of all, after the Second World War, international non-governmental organizations began to make their voices heard and became more active, especially in issues such as humanitarian aid and healing the wounds of war. With the end of the Cold War, the basic balance mechanism, referred to internationally as the "balance of powers", disappeared, the socialist system disappeared and world politics entered a process of restructuring. Liberal democracy, on the other hand, was identified with the end of history and emerged as the only governance model (Keyman, 1996:259). With this development, NGOs began to accelerate their activities in the international arena. The most important reason for this is that many issues that were left in the background, covered up or ignored due to the influence of the dominant political structure during the Cold War period, became politicized and international problems with the end of this period.

These problems include environmental problems, nuclear danger, the global terrorist threat that emerged after the September 11 attacks, climate change, human rights, women's rights, children's rights, etc. countable. In addition, the rise of ethnic identity politics that emerged in the post-Cold War period also caused the effectiveness of NGOs to increase. As a result, international NGOs increased their effectiveness and prestige in the international arena, and national NGOs began to get involved in foreign policy in various ways. The phenomenon of globalization, which can be defined as the intensification and acceleration of worldwide relations, and the problems and opportunities it brings with it, is one of the important reasons for the development of NGOs (Scholte, 2001: 15). With globalization, a number of connections across borders have both diversified and increased in number, thus enabling the movement of capital, goods and information at a speed that was not possible before (Heywood, 2011:37).

In addition, the internet has become a more effective political tool (Davut Ateş and Ahmet Uysal, 2006:69). Developments in information and communication technologies and the ease of sharing and accessing information through global networks have also increased the importance and effectiveness of NGOs (Aronson, 2001:551). With this new development, NGOs, on the one hand, have the opportunity to organize more quickly and effectively and make their voices heard, and on the other hand, with the acceleration of the flow of information, they have become more effective actors in both identifying problems and determining the solutions that can be developed against these problems (For example; Arab Spring the role of social media and communication technologies in the process).

On the other hand, global problems such as environmental problems, nuclear danger, epidemics that come to light with globalization, and the sensitivity of NGOs to these new problems and their search for solutions are among the reasons that increase their importance. NGOs step in to solve these problems; They play important roles in perceiving problems, seeking solutions, and reflecting them into joint actions. In addition to all these, the developments have revealed that the distinction between domestic policy and foreign policy has become blurred and the interest in foreign policy has increased.

Nowadays, NGOs are trying to participate not only in domestic politics but also in foreign policy in various ways and to influence decision makers on the policy that should be followed (Gürpınar:1-3). All these developments have increased the interest of NGOs in international relations and foreign policy with various purposes and means, expanded the scope of their activities in this field, and today they have begun to take their place in the actor typology as non-governmental-national actors in the discipline of international relations (Gürpınar:1-3). In addition, the developments did not only affect NGOs. Especially with the developments that emerged in the early nineties, society's interest in foreign policy began to increase. Şule Kut expresses this situation as follows; "Both international problems and foreign policy have been discussed by the public in Turkey perhaps more than ever before" (Kut, 1998:13). Barry Rubin summarizes this new situation as follows; "The old system in which the state acted largely autonomously and imposed certain policies and structures" has been replaced by a new foreign policy climate in which "interest groups and political pluralism" have developed and "different forces that shape and influence foreign policy have emerged" (Rubin, 2002:13).

After this period, interest in foreign policy increased and became increasingly effective and organized. Now governments also need the information, analysis and work of NGOs on foreign policy issues. The most important reason for this is that NGOs can exchange information faster, benefit from information and communication technologies relatively faster and more effectively, interact with national and international NGOs, and conduct in-depth research on certain issues. As can be seen, the prestige of NGOs in the fields of international relations and foreign policy is gradually increasing, their opinions, information and analysis are consulted by governments, and they are becoming actors with the various roles they undertake. As a result, foreign policy, which was considered an area above politics and ideologies in the pre-Cold War period, has now turned into an area of political debate and ideological competition (Güvenç, 2007:165-170).

Non-Governmental Organizations and the Rise of Civil Society in Turkey

In the current period when non-governmental organizations in Turkey have started to accelerate their international activities, it has become essential to evaluate the internationalization process brought about by globalization from the perspective of civil society and to develop suggestions for improving the process by following the developments in this field (Meray, 2007:25-35). Civil society, as a concept, corresponds to an area that is outside state control, has a political nature at a certain level, directly or indirectly, but essentially implements civil activities, relationships and interests aimed at solving social problems.

At the same time, civil society is a public discussion area aimed at solving civil social problems between the state, economy and family, and the organizational activity where this discussion is implemented. Non-governmental organizations are organizational activities that aim to find solutions to certain social problems, protect certain values and realize certain interests (Keyman, 2006). In other words, today, legal organizations such as associations, foundations, unions, confederations, employer organizations, professional federations, professional organizations, unions, chambers, local unions, cooperatives and media are now accepted as NGOs (Öztürk and Levent Şahin, 2011:4- 10).

The phenomenon of civil society, which reflects the changes that have taken place both internationally and in Turkey in recent times, has begun to have a wide spread area, from economy to politics, from culture to all aspects of social life. For this reason, in order to better understand the social and political events taking place both locally and internationally, it is an inevitable necessity to take into account civil organizations, which can also be referred to as non-state social organizations.

Although the history of the concept of civil society in Turkey dates back to the Ottoman period and the early republic in certain professional fields, the formation of civil society as an autonomous and organizational living space outside the economic and political sphere dates back to much more recent times. NGOs have played an important role in the development of societies from history to today. Today, civil society in Turkey continues to exist, most commonly known as associations and foundations. The majority of the associations established in Turkey to date have been associations established for aid and charitable purposes (DPT, 2000).

Since the Seljuk period, organizations in the form of foundations have been seen and it has been witnessed that they have undertaken many important tasks in economic and social life. In fact, these NGOs gained more power during the Ottoman period, increased in number, and experienced their golden age in terms of functionality (Özdemir, 2004: 129-161). Historically, it is seen that the number of non-governmental organizations in Turkey is proportionally less than the NGOs in the world. However, it is seen that Turkey made a new start in the organization and formation of civil society in the second half of the 1980s. During this period, the visits of government officials together with businessmen to Central Asian countries and Turkic republics played an important role in opening the business world in Turkey to the international arena and, indirectly, in the rise of non-governmental organizations. In addition, in parallel with the developments in the world, after the military coup of September 12, 1980, the "debate on whether the individual is for the state or the state is for the individual" attracted the attention of all layers of society and started to expand the field of civil society (Öztürk and Levent Şahin, 2011:15-20).

Civil society corresponds to an area that is outside state control, has a political nature at a certain level, directly or indirectly, but essentially implements civil activities, relationships and interests aimed at solving social problems. There are some turning points that play a major role in increasing the effectiveness of civil society in Turkey. One of these is the HABITAT II conference held in Istanbul in 1996. UN-HABITAT was established to ensure the coordination of human settlements activities at the United Nations, to exchange information on sustainable human settlements and settlement programs, and to provide technical assistance and financial support to countries in solving the problems encountered in cities.

UN-HABITAT, whose first conference was held in Vancouver in 1976, did not receive a large number of participants because two-thirds of the member countries lived in rural areas. However, as a result of the HABITAT II Conference, the "Habitat Agenda" and the "Istanbul Declaration", which are the basic documents of UN-HABITAT, were accepted. With these documents, governments have committed to providing adequate housing opportunities for all citizens and developing sustainable human settlements (UN Human Settlements Program (UN-HABITAT), 2015). What makes HABITAT II a turning point in terms of the development of civil society in Turkey is that, inspired by the UN Convention, the conference held negotiations on the development of sustainable human settlements in a world where there is adequate housing and urbanization for everyone, and in doing so, civil society was one of the most important actors. It was emphasizing that it would happen.

After this conference, civil society began to gain the feature of being a community of individuals and organizations that are in constant development, autonomous from the state, capable of directing and making sense of their own development without resorting to any higher identity or realism, containing the necessary dynamics for this (Maragoz, 2009:7). The 1990s and beyond in Turkey brought a number of opportunities and

innovations in the field of civil society, as in many areas. Another important reason for preparing the environment for these innovations was the end of the Cold War period.

The end of the Cold War paved the way for the gradual dissolution of the phenomenon of society and, on a more concrete level, the rigid formation on societies. At the same time, the decrease in economic and technological restrictions in the same period contributed to the formation of civil society and the spread of the concept of 'being informed', which is an important element of civil society. Again, before the 1990s, it is seen that state legislation in Turkey did not allow civil society to develop, let alone open up to the outside world.

As the state monopoly on society decreased in the early 2000s, the pressure on civil society began to lift and the organization of civil groups began to increase. Changes in domestic and foreign politics, globalization, changes in the international arena (Arab Spring, Mavi Marmara incident, Annan Plan put forward for the solution of the Cyprus problem, referendum in Iraq and the reaction of NGOs in Turkey) and emerging international humanitarian problems (e.g. Emerging international threats (radical organizations such as Daesh, Al Qaeda, etc.) have increased the role of NGOs. While NGOs are gaining importance in the world, it is impossible for Turkey not to be affected by these developments. For this reason, NGOs are gaining increasing importance in Turkey day by day. With the transformation of traditional diplomacy, non-governmental organizations have become one of the main actors of diplomacy and have begun to take part in the foreign policy planning and implementation processes of states. Within the framework of these norms, one of the areas of influence of non-governmental organizations is public diplomacy activities in the foreign policy processes of states.

Today, almost no government conducts public diplomacy alone. In addition to governments, non-governmental organizations, research centers, private sector and non-governmental organizations play important roles in the execution phase, and governments also coordinate the cooperation between organizations outside themselves (Tuncer, 2009:128). After the devastating consequences of the Second World War, the sphere of influence and target of diplomatic activities in foreign policy focused on individuals as well as states. As a result, the process of using non-governmental organizations heavily in public diplomacy has begun. Non-governmental organizations, which have an intense relationship with the public in terms of their structure and work, not only influence policy makers in the law-making process, but also have a significant impact on foreign policy and public diplomacy.

Many non-governmental organizations in Turkey have become both national and international actors. Non-governmental organizations not only make significant contributions to the reputation of countries, but also convey the foreign policy perspectives of countries to target countries and societies through their activities in order to establish strong inter-societal relations.

Due to the increasing importance and effectiveness of non-governmental organizations in Turkey in recent years, these organizations have begun to perform important tasks, from reflecting national policies to conveying messages at the cultural level (Aydemir, 2016:355-356). These organizations act by considering the interests of their countries in the execution process of foreign policy.

At this point, Turkish non-governmental organizations implement the multifaceted interests of Turkish foreign policy, in line with Turkey's economic and political goals, in line with its regional position and targets, in an informal way, generally determined by the government (Aydemir, 2016:356).

If we list the areas of responsibility of NGOs in Turkey; Humanitarian Aid Activities, Foreign Economic Relations and Research, Education and Cultural Studies. Humanitarian Aid Activities In Turkish foreign policy and public diplomacy, humanitarian aid activities are one of the areas where both the state level and Turkish non-governmental organizations work most intensively and are most successful (BBC, 2013). Turkey carries out its humanitarian aid activities through both state-supported public institutions and privately supported non-governmental organizations. These activities are carried out and managed in a coordinated manner by public institutions and non-governmental organizations in the target regions.

However, although civil society in Turkey has a historical background such as foundations, the phenomenon of civil society in the Western sense is still relatively new (Çaha, 2006). It is natural that there are old practices and traditions in Turkey regarding NGOs, non-state and voluntary organizations. However, with its current function, the phenomenon of civil society in Turkey is new and underdeveloped (Mağa, 2001: 7-17). The issue of carrying out activities with the active participation of the public in Turkey is also a major crisis and this crisis continues to be alive. As a matter of fact, organization, voluntary unity, having a democratic internal structure and active participation of the public are essential in non-governmental organizations. We can say that Turkey was also influenced by actor-based neo-liberalism, which takes state and non-state actors into consideration and emphasizes the free market economy, and reflects this view in its foreign policy discourse and practices after 1980. In this context, in many areas, including education, health and social security, the state leaves its duties to NGOs or the market ("European Union", 2001). In line with the purpose shown here, neo-liberal understandings try to dominate ideas by continuing their effectiveness in every field of activity. There are

many NGOs in Turkey that can be evaluated within the framework of movements representing civil initiative. It is possible to group them as follows (“EU Harmonization Process and NGOs”, 2004; Çaha, 2017: 75-80).

1. “Professional” non-governmental organizations (Professional Chambers, unions and media organizations),
2. Employer organizations/professional federations: Employer organizations such as TİSK and TÜSİAD (TÜSİAD, 2017) operating before 1980, and employer associations such as MÜSİAD (MÜSİAD, 2017), AGİAD, ASKON, GESİAD, TÜĞİAD, KAGİDER after 1980,
3. Worker and civil servant unions: TÜRK-İŞ, HAK-İŞ, DİSK, Memur-Sen, Kamu-Sen and KESK,
4. Non-governmental organizations developing in the field of "rights and freedoms": Human Rights Association, Mazlum-Der,
5. Traditional conservative non-governmental organizations: Maarif Foundation
6. Non-governmental organizations developing in the field of Thought Platform: Liberal Thought Community, Freedom Research Association, TESEV, TÜSEV,
7. Non-governmental organizations that emerged around ethnic and cultural rights: Caucasian associations, Alevi associations, Kurdish movement,
8. One of the areas that attract attention as a civil society front is the sensitivity and sensitivities regarding the environment: TEMA, Turkish Environment Foundation, Natural Life Protection Association,
9. Another category includes organizations with Atatürkist lines, such as the Atatürkist Thought Association and the Contemporary Life Support Association, which developed in the 1980s (Çaha, 2017: 75-80).
10. Another area where non-governmental organizations develop is search-rescue and cooperation activities: AKUT, Deniz Feneri, Turkish Red Crescent, Diyanet Foundation, Human Rights and Freedoms Humanitarian Relief Foundation (IHH), Volunteers, Hayrat Humanitarian Relief Foundation, Aziz Hüdayi Foundation, Cansuyu Assistance and Solidarity Association, Yardımcı International Humanitarian Aid Association, Doctors Worldwide, Search and Rescue Association, Beşir Association, Sadakataşı Association, Vuşlat Association
11. We can also include international Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) operating in Turkey in the field of civil society: Conrad Adenaur foundation, Amnesty International, Helsinki Monitoring Committee, Green Peace, etc.

There are many associations, foundations and unions representing the above NGO groups. The most effective and powerful of these NGOs are businessmen's associations (TUSİAD, MUSİAD, etc.), foundations (TESEV, TEMA Foundation, TEV, etc.), chambers of industry and commerce, which can be evaluated within the neo-liberal framework. Especially with the EU process, the work of neoliberalist NGOs has mostly consisted of creating public opinion in favor of the EU and directing society. The most prominent non-governmental organizations established in Turkey since the 1980s are; environmental groups (Turkish Nature Conservation Association, Natural Life Protection Association, Turkey Environmental Problems Foundation, TEMA), women's associations (representatives of secular feminism and Islamic women's movement), Alevi groups (Cem Foundation, Pir Sultan Abdal Association, Hacı Bektaş Veli Associations and Foundations).), associations and organizations that provide a prescription for the Southeast issue within the framework of Kurdish ethnic demands, associations operating on human rights (Human Rights Association, etc.), and the Liberal Thought Community (Çaha, 2003: 262-275).

In the 21st century, non-governmental organizations, which have become more organized and more active, have only been able to present a feasibility study to decision makers in the formation of foreign policy and have a supporting role in the implementation of foreign policy, rather than directing Turkish foreign policy. The transcendent state discourse that continues in Turkey has a great impact on this. According to Ali Yaşar Sarıbay, the understanding of civil society in Turkey has come to its current use from the idea that the word "State" in the Turkish-Ottoman understanding is the greatest happiness. The transition from statism, where individualism was condemned and uniformity was common, to civil society was achieved in this process (Sarıbay, 1998: 447-461).

The Role of NGOs in Turkey-Azerbaijan Relations

The reputation of NGOs in the fields of international relations and foreign policy is increasing. Foreign policy, which was considered a field of politics and ideology in the pre-Cold War period, has now become an area of political debate and ideological competition. Turkey has also been affected by this development in the world. Especially after 1983, non-governmental organizations and non-governmental organizations began to gain more importance through the use of neo-liberalism in Turkey's foreign policy discourse.

Especially in the 2000s, Turkey emphasized public diplomacy in foreign policy and many public diplomacy organizations were established. Humanitarian aid, foreign economic relations, architectural and cultural activities, education and research are the main areas of work of Turkish public diplomacy. In addition to

the official Turkish public diplomacy organizations operating in regions such as the Balkans, the Middle East, Central Asia and North Africa, non-governmental organizations have also been taking an active role in the civilian part of public diplomacy and the implementation of foreign policy in recent years.

Non-governmental organizations in Azerbaijan have been similarly affected by global and regional developments. Most NGOs have made structural changes in their internal management and adopted international pioneering experiences. Most NGOs focus on well-defined goals, and some continue to engage in activities beyond their core focus to win grants.

They create social awareness through promotions and social presentations made on the digital platform with the developments in information technologies. In addition, volunteers are constantly involved in NGO activities and are widely employed. The development of NGOs in Turkey and Azerbaijan has increased the role of non-governmental organizations in the bilateral relations of the countries.

It is possible to divide the role of NGOs in the relations between the two countries into several groups and give examples. The most important of these are the promotional activities of Azerbaijani associations in Turkey in this country, the promotional activities of some Turkish associations in Azerbaijan in this country, the activities of some NGOs in Azerbaijan in Turkey, the activities of some NGOs in Turkey in Azerbaijan,

Joint activities of Azerbaijani and Turkish NGOs in these two countries, joint activities of Azerbaijani and Turkish NGOs in a third country regarding the problem of one of these two countries or a common issue, activities of Azerbaijani and Turkish NGOs in a more general framework but affecting the other country. Activities including activities related to OSCE, NATO and other international organizations, Muslim or Turkish identity include the activities of NGOs in third countries that contain one or both of the words "Azerbaijan" and "Turkish" in their names.

NGOs in Azerbaijan have worked in cooperation with the state to a significant extent in terms of bilateral relations, in a complementary role to official policy. Some NGOs worked in areas where the state was relatively less interested in foreign policy. Efforts towards greater integration of Turkey and Azerbaijan or efforts to meet Turkey's expectations for the recognition of the TRNC can be evaluated within this framework. In some periods, the activities of Azerbaijani NGOs have attracted more attention, especially in the "protocols process", in terms of activities aimed at supporting decision makers in directing public opinion and in directly or indirectly influencing the country where the influence of official state policy is lacking.

It is also possible to give recent examples of the ways and roles of some NGOs in Turkey in foreign policy. Among the NGOs in Turkey, some of those qualified as research centers have carried out serious work in cooperation with the state, in the role of complementing the official policy. For example, officials of both countries attended the meetings organized by KÖKSAV, ASAM, TUSAM, SETAV, TASAM, USAK, ORSAM, TÜRSAM and some other NGOs, and the meetings were mostly aimed at explaining and basing the policies of the current administrations and contributing to existing relations. It has also been observed that these NGOs qualified as Research Centers provide support to decision makers in terms of expertise and directing public opinion. It is also worth remembering that the Eurasian Strategic Research Center (ASAM), which has paused its work for a long time, especially in support of public opinion formation through expert support and scientific studies, has carried out very serious work. ASAM has also organized many meetings in Turkey and Azerbaijan regarding bilateral relations and more general issues.

Among the organizations in Turkey that work in areas that the state left vacant in foreign policy, did not show much interest in, or felt obliged to not show much interest in, and made serious contributions to relations with Azerbaijan, some NGOs, especially Türk Ocağı, Azerbaijan Culture Association, Marmara Group, TÜDEV, are among the organizations that have made significant contributions to the relations with Azerbaijan. have done studies. (Aslanlı and Vefa Kurban, 2016:33-35). Çanakkale Azerbaijan House, Azerbaijan House Association, Ankara Azerbaijan House Association, Istanbul Turkish Azerbaijan Friendship Culture and Solidarity Association, Eskişehir Azerbaijan Association, Antalya Azerbaijan House Association, Istanbul Azerbaijan Culture and Art Association are examples of these.

Some of the names of Azerbaijan and Turkey, where these associations are seeking integration, are united under a common roof with the Federation of Associations. Some other NGOs, including Turkish NGOs, Azerbaijan Cultural Association, Marmara Group and TÜDEV, carried out serious work. TURKSAM exhibits one of the most important examples of trying to contribute to bilateral relations by appealing to the Azerbaijani and Turkish public, politicians and media for direct or indirect influence on Azerbaijan during periods when the official government policy is not effective. TURKSAM is also one of the non-governmental organizations that constantly conducts studies (research, publications, events, statements, etc.) on the main areas of interest of Azerbaijan.

II. METHODOLOGY

Qualitative research method was preferred in this study. There are different methods and different perspectives on creating a research plan in a qualitative research process. For example; Joseph A. Maxwell's nine parameters determined for his study proposal, John Creswell's methods and stages developed on the research design and plan, and Morse and Richard's concept of methodological harmony are important contributions to the research methods literature.

To elaborate on the concept of methodological harmony that will be taken as basis in this study; It means "the research objectives, questions, and methods are all interconnected and interrelated so that the study appears as a coherent whole rather than fragmented, isolated parts." In this process, the researcher tends to follow these interconnected parts.

One of the researchers who care about the integrity of method, purpose and research questions is John Creswell. Creswell, in his book "Research Design: Qualitative Quantitative And Mixed Methods Approaches", listed the main characteristic features of qualitative research as follows: Natural environment, researcher as the basic tool, multiple methods, complex reasoning through inductive and deductive logic, pattern that emerges over time, reflectivity, holistic approach. explanation (Creswell, 2017: 183-189).

The aim of the study is to create a research plan and analyze the subject, taking into account the basic features of the qualitative research method and academic ethical rules. In this regard, within the scope of source review, theoretical research and case study, which are qualitative research methods, universities, libraries, online databases will be used, and Turkish and foreign sources (scientific reports, academic articles, books, papers, etc.) will be used.

III. DISCUSSION

Members of non-governmental organizations can only take part in any unit of the state and be active within that institutional structure. This causes them to become politicized, that is, to lose their status as a member of a non-governmental organization. In this process, foreign policy decision makers; It can encourage some of the NGOs that the state controls and legitimizes itself in front of the national and international public and offer them more areas of activity in line with foreign policy principles. However, it is out of the question for the state, which has its own norms, institutions, laws and power to rule, to have a civil society-type organizational management and to meet the needs and demands of a certain segment of the country, as this would lead to polarization within the country.

The crucial point here and the main deterrent issue for NGOs is the state's power and ability to rule. State; It may close down some NGOs or restrict their financial opportunities when it perceives them to be a threat to the administration and foreign policy practices or when it deems it necessary. But NGOs cannot direct the functioning of the state, nor can they influence the state's institutions, organizations and laws. Non-governmental organizations only create a certain public opinion and draw attention to certain issues. In the light of this information, we can list the main reasons why NGOs in Turkey are weak and cannot have a guiding influence on foreign policy as follows;

1. Fear of the state: Fear of the state and the conformity it brings blunts the diversity and differences of civil society. It eliminates critical perspective, freedom of expression and originality and pushes non-governmental organizations into monotony.
2. Discourse glorifying the state: The state, which is the most basic concept of Turkish political culture, is glorified within this culture and rises above individuals and communities. Non-governmental organizations are forced into this state-dependent culture.
3. Economic dependency: Since most of the property and production is under the monopoly of the state, the dependence of social resistance on the state poses an obstacle to the development of civil society. This title is also called the first level title. The findings section should be added for research articles, and a title appropriate to the subject should be added for review articles.

The internationalization process of non-governmental organizations in Turkey is directly related to the developments and changes of civil society after the 90s. With the changes in the political structure of the state, the acceleration of its opening to the world, the increase in transportation and technology opportunities and the increase in social dynamism in this direction, the need to establish relations with different geographies has arisen. Currently, many foundations and associations in Turkey are still continuing their internationalization process, and some are just expanding into this field. However, especially the work of institutions that have been operating in the international arena for many years - first unofficially, but then officially - has the capacity to lead in this field.

IV. FINDINGS

It can be said that the internationalization process in NGOs brings with it a certain level of institutionalization in the working and organizational styles of the organizations. While NGOs were institutions in the 1990s where mostly volunteer-based and non-professional personnel came together to operate, they have turned into institutions that provide an advantageous working environment for qualified employees since the 2000s, when their employee profiles began to rise. The threshold of criteria has begun to rise both in the recruitment of institutions and in the selection of employees. Especially with the globalization process, people who know more than one language and are in contact with more than one culture have begun to be employed in NGOs. Although this situation does not continue at the same pace in every NGO, it is possible to say that institutionalization is gaining momentum in this direction in general.

V. CONCLUSION

In today's world, where globalization continues at a rapid pace and there is almost no sector left outside its scope, non-governmental organizations are now taking initiative, trying to find solutions and creating public opinion on issues such as social assistance and human rights, before states. However, although non-governmental organizations in Turkey have gained an international dimension by being affected by many cyclical changes such as globalization, they cannot reach an autonomous structure autonomous from the state and mostly appear as a tool to legitimize foreign policy. In the light of all the information, it can be said that; With "globalization", which is a factor that strengthens and develops the civil society-foreign policy relationship, non-governmental organizations in Turkey have become effective actors in creating public opinion. However, the activities of many NGOs remain in the shadow of the foreign policy principles and practices of decision makers. Factors such as the existence of a political culture that glorifies the state in Turkey and the economic dependence of NGOs on the state play a major role in this regard.

It can be said that the place of non-governmental organizations in Azerbaijan-Turkey relations is relatively small. However, it is also observed that this field is developing day by day and the role played by NGOs in bilateral relations is increasing day by day. It has been determined that NGOs serve as a solid bridge and have a serious potential, especially on sensitive issues (Karabakh issue, TRNC, PKK terrorism) and important processes (protocols, Mavi Marmara attack, etc.). It would be beneficial to intensify initiatives to add breadth and depth to this field. Before this, perhaps a very serious field study and a complete assessment of the situation regarding the place of NGOs in bilateral relations should be carried out. In the recent meetings of the High Level Strategic Cooperation Council, the importance of greater involvement of civil society in bilateral relations was emphasized.

REFERENCES

- [1]. Aronson, J. (2001). "The Communications and Internet Revolution". (John Baylis and Steve Smith, Ed.). The Globalization of World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations. 2. Edition. New York: Oxford University Press.
- [2]. Aslanlı, A. and Vefa Kurban. (2016). "Azerbaycan-Türkiye İlişkileri ve Sivil Toplum Kuruluşları". Marmara Türkiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi. Cilt:3. Sayı: 1. s: 31-43.
- [3]. Ateş, D. and Ahmet Uysal. (2006). "Merkez-Dışı Ülkelerdeki Sivil Toplum Kuruluşları (STK): Dış Politika, Finansman ve Meşruiyet", Dumlupınar Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, Sayı:16.
- [4]. Aydemir, E. (2016). Dış Politikada Yumuşak Güç ve Medya. İstanbul: Kalkedon Yayınları.
- [5]. Creswell, J. (2017). Araştırma Deseni: Nitel, Nicel ve Karma Yöntem Yaklaşımları. (Selçuk B. Demir vd., Çev.). Ankara: Eğiten Kitap Yayıncılık. (2015).
- [6]. Çaha, Ö. (2017). Sivil Toplum Sivil Topluma Karşı: Sivil Toplumun Türkiye'deki ve Dünyadaki Serüveni. İstanbul: Mana Yayınları.
- [7]. Çaha, Ö. (2003). Aşkın Devletten Sivil Topluma. İstanbul: Gendaş A.S. Yayınları.
- [8]. Çaha, Ö. (2006). "Bir Kez Daha Sivil Toplum", <http://www.siviltoplum.com.tr> (son erişim tarihi 15.06.2006).
- [9]. DPT, (2000). Küreselleşme Özel İhtisas Komisyon Raporu. VIII. Beş Yıllık Kalkınma Planı (Rap.), Ankara: T.C. Kalkınma Bakanlığı.
- [10]. Gürpınar, B. "Türkiye Dış Politikasında Bir Aktör: TÜSİAD", <https://www.academia.edu/7539794/TUSIAD>.
- [11]. Güvenç, S. (2007). "Türkiye'nin Dış Politikası ve Düşünce Kuruluşları", https://www.academia.edu/1272022/T%C3%BCrkiyenin_D%C4%B1%C5%9F_Politikas%C4%B1_ve_D%C3%BC%C5%9F%C3%BCnce_Kurulu%C5%9Flar%C4%B1, 2007.
- [12]. Heywood, A. (2011). Siyasal İdeolojiler: Bir Giriş. (Kemal Bayram, Özgür Tüfekçi, Hüsamettin İnaç, Şeyma Akın ve Buğra Kalkan, Çev.). 3. Baskı. Ankara: Adres Yayınları.
- [13]. Keyman, E. Fuat. (1996). "Eleştirel Düşünce: İletişim, Hegemonya, Kimlik/fark". Devlet, Sistem ve Kimlik: Uluslararası İlişkilerde Temel Yaklaşımlar. (Atile Eralp, Der.). İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- [14]. Keyman, F. (2006). Türkiye'de Sivil Toplumun Serüveni: İmkânsızlıklar İçinde Bir Vaha. Ankara: Sivil Toplum Geliştirme Merkezi.
- [15]. Mağa, İ. (2001). "Sivil Toplum Devletin Büyümesidir". Sivil Toplum Devletin Büyümesi, İstanbul: YGS Yayınları.
- [16]. Marangoz, M. (2009). "Toplumsal Barışın Sağlanmasında STK'ların Rolü", Dernekler Dergisi.
- [17]. Kut, Ş. (1998). "Türkiye'nin Soğuk Savaş Sonrası Dış Politikasının Anahtarları". En Uzun On Yıl: Türkiye'nin Ulusal Güvenlik ve Dış Politika Gündeminde Doksanlı Yıllar. (Gencer Özcan ve Şule Kut, Der.). İstanbul: Boyut Kitapları.
- [18]. Meray, A. (2007). Türkiye'de Uluslararası Sivil Toplum Kuruluşlarının Siyasal Karar Alma Mekanizmalarına Etkisi, (Yayınlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi). Muğla Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Kamu Yönetimi Anabilim Dalı. Muğla.

- [19]. Miall, H. and Tom Woodhouse. (1999). *Contemporary Conflict Resolution: The Prevention, Management and Transformation of Deadly Conflicts*. USA: Polity Press.
- [20]. Özdemir, S. (2004). "Kar Gütmeyen Kuruluşlar (KGK) ve Sosyal Refahın Sağlanmasında Artan Rolü", İ.Ü. İktisat Fakültesi Sosyal Siyaset Konferansları.
- [21]. Öztürk, M.ve Levent Şahin. (2011). "Küreselleşme Sürecinde Sivil Toplum Kuruluşları ve Türkiye'deki Durumu", Sosyal Siyaset Konferansları Dergisi. Sayı: 54. s. 3-29.
- [22]. Rubin, B. (2002). "Türkiye'nin Dış Politikasını Anlamak", Günümüzde Türkiye'nin Dış Politikası, (Barry Rubin ve Kemal Kirişçi, Der.). İstanbul: Boğaziçi Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- [23]. Sarıbay, A. (1998). "Türkiye'de Demokrasi ve Sivil Toplum", Küreselleşme- Sivil Toplum ve İslam. Ankara: Vadi Yayınları.
- [24]. Scholte, Jan Aart. (2001). "The Globalization of World Politics". (John Baylis and Steve Smith, Ed.). *The Globalization of World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations*, 2. Edition. New York: Oxford University Press.
- [25]. Sönmezoglu, F. (2005). *Uluslararası Politika ve Dış Politika Analizi*. İstanbul: Filiz Kitabevi.
- [26]. Şahin, M. (2013). "Case Study: Türkiye'nin Ortadoğu ve Kuzey Afrika'da Uyguladığı Kamu Diplomasisi Faaliyetleri", Kamu Diplomasisi (A. Yalçinkaya ve Y. Özgen, Ed.). İstanbul: Bahçeşehir Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- [27]. Tuncer, H. (2009). *Diplomasinin Evrimi, Gizli Diplomasiden Küresel Diplomasiye*. İstanbul: Kaynak Yayınları.
- [28]. Willetts, P. (2001). "Transnational Actors and International Organizations in Global Politics". (John Baylis and Steve Smith, Ed.). *The Globalization of World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations*. 2. Edition. New York: Oxford University Press.
- [29]. Yalçinkaya, H. et. al. (2006). "Değişen Silahlı Çatışma ortamında Sivil Toplum Kuruluşlarının Güvenlik İhtiyaçlarının Karşlanması: Afganistan ve Anso Örneği". III. Uluslararası Sivil Toplum Kuruluşları Kongresi, Bildiriler Kitabı: STK-Özel Sektör-Devlet Etkileşimi. Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart Üniversitesi Biga İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi, Çanakkale.
- [30]. Avrupa Birliği, (2001). "Devlet ve STK'lar". Türkiye'de Sivil Toplum Kuruluşları Sempozyumu VII, İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı Yayınları.
- [31]. "AB Uyum Süreci ve STK'lar". (2004). Türkiye'de Sivil Toplum Kuruluşları Sempozyumu XIV. İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı Yayınları.
- [32]. BBC, (2013). "İnsani Yardım Sıralamasında Türkiye Dördüncü." Erişim Tarihi: 30 Mayıs 2017, http://www.bbc.co.uk/turkce/haberler/2013/07/130717_turkiye_insani_yardim.shtml.
- [33]. TÜSİAD. (2017). Erişim Tarihi: 30 Mayıs 2017. <http://www.tusiad.org/tr/tusiad/temsilcilikler>.
- [34]. MUSİAD. (2017). Erişim Tarihi: 30 Mayıs 2017. <http://www.musiad.org.tr/tr-tr/subeler>.
- [35]. "BM İnsan Yerleşimleri Programı (UN-HABITAT)". (t.y.), <http://www.mfa.gov.tr/birlesmis-milletler-insan-yerlesimleri-programi.tr.mfa>.
- [36]. <http://www.azerbaycankulder.org/dernek.aspx>, (27.07.2015).

Nurbanu Bulgur, "The Role of the Interaction between NGOs and Foreign Policy in Turkey-Azerbaijan Relations". *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Invention(IJHSSI)*, vol.12 , no.9 ,2023 , pp.182-190 .